

PART 3 –RESEARCH IN THE BEST INTERESTS OF OUR CHILDREN

(For **Section One – A Critique of the Pascal Report** – please return to the home page.)

Section Two - Evidence of lasting harms & no lasting benefits resulting from similar policies AND Evidence of benefits from late, not early, school entry age

SWEDEN

- Sweden is often hailed as the country we should emulate. But outcomes for children in that country, indicate we should NOT go down their path. It is also worth noting that a growing number of parents in that country are fighting to dismantle their system because of the problems it has created, problems that became obvious after a generation of kids were raised in a universal daycare program. The Swedish group, '**A Child's Right to their Parents Time**', has achieved and continues to achieve success at securing policies that put parents at the centre of their children's lives.

Academic:

- The claim is that universal programs of this nature will help kids 'succeed'. But, Canadian teens far outperform Swedish teens on all OECD Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) academic tests: we score an average of 534 against their 503. Canada is almost at the top, well above the OECD average, while big-daycare Sweden and France are below the OECD average.
- Swedish academic outcomes have plummeted in the long years of mass daycare.

Youth violence and suicide:

Pascal Report: *"We will see...a reduction of youth violence"*(p 6-7)

Swedish National Board of Health and Welfare:

- *"Youth suicide has "risen dramatically."*
- *"psychological problems are increasing among young people and women... Violence is also an increasing problem...with roughly one in ten residents having been subject to some sort of violence.*

** reported in "Young Swedes' mental health deteriorating: report" Published: 25 Mar 09, The Local- Swedens' News in English

<http://www.thelocal.se/18444/20090325/>

Illness:

Pascal Report: *“We will see...greater well-being of 12 year olds including greater resiliency and health outcomes”(p 6-7)*

Swedish National Board of Health and Welfare: *“Children in centre care are 6.78 times more likely to be sick than children in parental care.”*

**page 18 of Sweden’s National Board of Health and Welfare’s publication “Smitta I förskolan” (Eng. approx.: “Contagion in preschool”)
<http://www.socialstyrelsen.se/Publicerat/2008/10130/2008-126-1.htm>

Women’s Inequality:

- **Swedish women experience increased domestic violence**
CBC interview “The Current” May 27, 2005
<http://www.cbc.ca/thecurrent/2005/200505/20050527.html>
- Sweden has one of the most highly sex-segregated workforces in the OECD, with women concentrated in low-pay public sector jobs
 - *“If they would demand (and get) compensation, all achievements in female dominated sectors will disappear into inflation”*
 - *“According to Statistics Sweden ([SCB](#)), the primary explanation concerning gender inequalities seems to be choice of occupation. According to the survey, women are more likely than men to take up work within low-wage professions.”*European Industrial Relations Observatory
<http://www.eurofound.europa.eu/eiro/studies/tn0808019s/se0808019q.htm>
- OECD: *“Sweden needs to address gender equity issues. There is strong gender segregation in public service employment (health, education, and childcare); ... **As a result, pay differences remain significant, and are not narrowing.** Among the top 20% of male and female earners, the gender wage gap is 19% in Sweden compared to the OECD average of 16%, and there are proportionally fewer women in management positions in Sweden than in Canada.”*
[*http://www.oecd.org/document/62/0,3343,en_2649_34819_34916798_1_1_1_1,00.html.](http://www.oecd.org/document/62/0,3343,en_2649_34819_34916798_1_1_1_1,00.html)

FRANCE

Pascal Report: *“All Ontario will benefit as more of our children do better in school, build great careers, have their own children, and contribute to our economic prosperity and **social cohesion.**”*

- France has reportedly had nearly 100% of its young children in full time preschool for years but the promise of social cohesion has not been realized. Race related riots have been recurring problems in recent years. In 2003 15,000 died in a heat wave – mostly seniors – due to “chronically insufficient care for the elderly.”

http://www.usatoday.com/weather/news/2003-09-25-france-heat_x.htm

Canada does far better in this area.

QUEBEC

Peer-reviewed, winning Milligan et study:

- Above under example 3 and ...
- *“The taxes generated from the increased maternal labour supply **fall far short of paying** for the increased childcare subsidies.”*

Other Canadian Economists on the Quebec System:

- *“...almost **70 percent of families have had to deal with a reduction in governmental financial assistance** to facilitate the increase in levels of support for approximately 30 percent of families. The results also show that the **financial loss for families increases with the number of children.**”*

**Institute for Research on Public Policy Choice – Family Policy Vol. 6, no 1
JANUARY 2000

<http://www.irpp.org/choices/archive/vol6no1.pdf> pp 4-5

- *“Since the only way to benefit from this program is to choose to go to work, it's not so much a child care program so much as a program designed to encourage mothers to return to work.”*

**“Equity and Quebec's daycare program” Worthwhile Canadian Initiative

http://worthwhile.typepad.com/worthwhile_canadian_initi/2006/06/on_the_equitabi.html

CALIFORNIA

- *“These programs fall short on some quality benchmarks, particularly those for the promotion of thinking and language skills.”*
- *“All groups of children in center-based ECE experience quality shortfalls.”*

* RAND Corporation 2007 “Room for Improvement in the Use of High-Quality Preschool Programs for California's Children”

http://www.rand.org/pubs/research_briefs/RB9358/index1.html

OKLAHOMA, TENNESSEE, GEORGIA

- *“The **Tennessee** program is considered a gold-standard. It meets 9 out of 10 criteria for a high-quality program set by the National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER)--such as preschool teachers with teaching credentials, small class-size, and comprehensive early-learning standards.”*

*“Yet, despite this extremely high quality program, an interim study on the program's progress done for the Tennessee Comptroller's Office finds **no lasting academic value for Tennessee students who participated in the public pre-kindergarten program.**”*

- *“In **Oklahoma and Georgia**, which both have decade-long universal preschool programs with high quality standards, **students score below the national average** on the National Assessment of Education Progress (NAEP), the nation's benchmark for student achievement? For example, Oklahoma, where state-funded pre-kindergarten has been in place for 18 years - and offered universally for nearly a decade, has **slipped below the national average on math and reading scores for both the fourth and eighth grades since it began expanding government preschool.**”*
- *“**Oklahoma scores fell** from one point above the national average in fourth grade math in 1992 to two points behind in 2007. They also **slipped behind** in eighth grade math, from one point ahead before the pre-K program to five points **behind the national average** after pre-K was implemented. In reading eighth grade scores slipped from four points ahead in 1998 to one point behind. And Oklahoma's fourth grade **reading scores plummeted** during the 1990's at the very same time the state was aggressively expanding preschool access, increasing attendance, and building a system that the NIEER rates as a 9 out of 10 on quality.”*

****“More Evidence that Universal Preschool Doesn't Offer Lasting Benefits: By second grade the benefits of one of the nation's 'best' universal pre-K programs are gone” Reason Foundation Lisa Snell August 22, 2008
<http://reason.org/news/show/1003109.html>*

CANADA

Even though they are promoters of this policy, Dr. Clyde Hertzman and the Human Early Learning Partnership (H.E.L.P.) state:

- *“Pro-social behaviour scores were lowest for children in licensed day care and highest for children in unregulated home care and relative care.”*
* Statistics Canada "National Data Sets: Sources of Information for Canadian Child Care Data" by Hertzman and two other HELP staff, p.14
<http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11f0019m/11f0019m2006284-eng.pdf>
- *“**Overview of the results:** ... following the introduction of control variables, participating in early childhood care and education programs and services at the age of 2 and 3 had little direct association with children's home and school outcomes in Kindergarten. The sole exception to this general pattern occurred for participation in 'other' [such as parent-child drop ins] early education programs.”*

***H.E.L.P.** "*The association of early childhood care and education to children's experiences in Kindergarten*" February 2006, by Dafna Kohen, Garth Lipps, and Clyde Hertzman (The key finding is buried on page 17 where you may not dig to find it.)

http://www.earlylearning.ubc.ca/documents/ECCE_Kohen_Lipps_Hertzman_Article_March_2006.pdf

Evidence of benefits from later not earlier school entry age:

FINLAND

- Finnish teens score the highest on OECD PISA tests, yet Fins do not begin formal schooling – that is learning ‘the 3 Rs’ until age 7.

RAND Corporation study

- A RAND study found that children who started school later – 72 months that is 6 years - did better on academic tests than those who started earlier.

* See charts pp 110-112, "The Impact of Changes in Kindergarten Entrance Age Policies on Children's Academic Achievement and the Child Care Needs of Families" http://www.rand.org/pubs/rgs_dissertations/RGSD177/